Remedies

Virginia Valian
Hunter College and CUNY Graduate Center

Implications from gender schemas

1) there's no silver bullet; we must be prepared to keep at the remedies
    a. why: schemas are ubiquitous and persistent
        i. revert to status quo ante: Eric Kaler example; MIT example

2) we need procedures that will allow us to check our work; we are going to make mistakes
    a. why: schemas resist change; we will not change our schemas anytime soon.
        i. VVV example in computer store
        ii. there has been change and there will continue to be change, but I chose experiments published in 2004 in order to demonstrate that schemas are alive, well, and active

3) to offset tendency to rely on schemas, gender efforts have to seem important
    a. speakers who are highly visible, credible, and respected; men as well as women
    b. symposia that are high-visibility
    c. high-visibility women scientists giving scientific and women-in-science talks

4) women do not automatically make better decisions; men do not automatically make worse decisions

Education: know the data, know the theory; communicate the data, communicate the theory

5) everybody has to understand how schemas work
    a. their persistence and ubiquity
    b. the limitations they set on our ability to judge others accurately
    c. use the data and the theory to inform proposals for remedies

6) teach undergraduate students how to evaluate graduate teaching assistants and faculty

        a. women teachers are evaluated less favorably by undergraduates than are men teachers, especially with respect to competence

7) teach faculty how to write letters of recommendation for students and postdocs
        a. recommenders do not write equally positive letters of recommendation for medical school job candidates (Trix & Psenka, 2003)

8) teach chairs and senior faculty how to nominate people for prizes, awards, etc.
        a. not all chairs and senior faculty see development of faculty as a primary responsibility

Examples of procedures

9) leaders must frequently, visibly, and personally demonstrate commitment to equity
        a. articulate goals
               i. be specific: numbers in hiring and retention and promotion; faculty, post-doc, student, and employee development
        b. say why goals are important for organization
               i. examples: innovation, diversity of working styles means good balance of risk and prevention, improvement of talent pool, building of loyalty to organization, lower costs for rehiring if retain people, create appearance of opportunity for younger people, client satisfaction
        c. hold people accountable
               i. make progress toward equity part of annual review
             ii. reward people who make progress toward goals
        d. create female leaders within organization
        e. why it works: leaders are disproportionately influential

10) benchmarks of progress; benchmarks of desired goal
        a. # men and women in candidate pool, applicant pool, short list, hired
        b. time in rank for men and women
        c. salary
        d. provide data to each department from institutional research person
               i. % female PhDs over last 5 years
             ii. % female post-docs, if known
          iii. department's history
                    1. number of hires per half-decade, presented separately by sex
                    2. attrition by sex
                    3. years in rank by sex
                    4. service on important committees by sex
                    5. salary by year of degree and sex
                    6. start-up packages by sex
        e. ask department to provide

               i.   annual nominations for prizes and awards by sex
              ii.   annual receipt of prizes and awards by sex
            iii.   colloquium speakers by sex
            iv.   efforts made to support faculty

      f.   publish data on university website for each major school or division

11) make sure that colloquia and other speaker events are appropriately balanced with respect to gender and color

      a.   students and post-docs need to see that there is room for them

      b.   rethink colloquia lists that do not represent availability

12) recruitment – train chairs of search committees and committee members

      a.   not as easy to obtain applicant pool of women and other nontraditional candidates

               i.   filters may be applied differently for men and women – shifting standards

              ii.   filters may be set inappropriately

            iii.   job may look "male" because of few women currently in job and few women applicants – want to increase % of women until have roughly $1/3^{rd}$ training of search committee chairs in how to run a good search

      b.   provide resources to help in finding possible candidates

      c.   use University of Michigan STRIDE-type teams

      d.   deans can provide funds to bring more candidates to campus than would normally be authorized

               i.   model: University of Delaware School of Engineering (Eric Kaler)

                    1.   normally 2-3 candidates authorized to visit for interview

                    2.   if nontraditional candidates, up to 4-5 more authorized

      e.   deans can reject searches that do not meet availability pool

13) retention and promotion efforts

      a.   develop higher-level review of credentials of those recommended and not recommended for tenure, promotion, or opportunities to represent institution organization in high-visibility settings

      b.   educate people in how to evaluate outside letters

14) accountability up and down ladder; example: chairs accountable to deans

      a.   evaluation

               i.   chairs write annual self- and department-appraisal, including efforts toward equity and diversity – about 7-8 pages in length

              ii.   dean writes 2-3 page evaluation

            iii.   dean and chair meet to discuss chair's performance

          iv. benefits to chair and department dependent in part on faculty development, which includes equity and diversity

      b. annual dean review of faculty salaries by sex

      c. dean review of start-up packages by sex

15) people, especially those in authority, must know what comments or assumptions, often intended pleasantly, are inappropriate

      a. small-group interviews can provide such information

          i. expectation that person will make coffee or serve group

          ii. surprise at woman's technical expertise

          iii. surprise at person of color's articulateness

16) develop informal women and men leaders who can be effective within their departments

Why women don't receive information – how networks work

17) homophily and homogeneity

      a. people divide along sex, race, class, education, and other demographic lines

      b. white men in US have most homogeneous networks

      c. women less likely to receive needed information than men

      d. women and people of color have thinner networks

Schemas interact with other mechanisms, such as network formation and operation

18) need to ensure that women and men equally receive relevant information about how to succeed in institution or organization

      a. provide workshops for women and men

          i. become successful outside the institution

          ii. build power by performing jobs which are out of the ordinary, visible, and are relevant to current institutional problems (Kanter, 1979)

          iii. negotiate for resources – but women must do this differently from men

          iv. make allies

          v. be impersonal (it is less distracting, less feminine)

          vi. be friendly and respectful (it takes sting out of competence and effectiveness

      b. help senior people, supervisors, and managers know what information to provide and how to provide it

in business
19) women must be in positions from which they can rise to the top
   a. in 2000 in the US, almost half of the Fortune 1000 companies had no female executives
   b. differences by industry
      i. firms with the highest percentage of executive women (ranging from 13 % to 16 %) included securities firms, computer software firms, and pharmaceutical companies
      ii. firms with the lowest percentage (ranging from 1 % to 4 %) included industries in semiconductors, energy, aerospace, and electronics and electrical equipment
   c. men and women have somewhat different areas of responsibility
      i. women are overrepresented in legal, public relations, human resources, accounting, and secretarial positions
      ii. men are overrepresented in operations (to a large degree) and finance
   d. bottleneck for women occurs in their reaching executive management positions; once they are in those positions they are promoted
      i. the percentage of women in line positions is about half that of the percentage of men
   e. low percentage of women in line positions that can take them to the top makes sense with gender schemas
      i. women do not look right for the responsibilities that line positions entail
      ii. filters that are in place differ – sometimes in subtle ways – for women and men
      iii. since explicit criteria for line positions and promotion are usually absent, upper-level decision makers are likely to shift their criteria when judging women and men, to the detriment of women

1) start with small wins
   a. change one small thing, such as length of time for interview